

Comparative Content Analysis: Immigration Coverage in Mainstream & Ethnic Media

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
SCARBOROUGH

RESEARCH

Research questions: What are the main themes about immigration, and how is immigration coverage framed? Which news sources promote? and b) what news frames are used?

Ethnic: New Canadian Media, World Journal
Mainstream: National Post, The Vancouver Sun, Toronto Star

PURPOSE

Background (Immigrants & news frame):

- News frames must be studied because they influence the way we perceive and interpret complex issues related to immigrants.
- Cross-media comparisons in abundance and these news outlets help immigrants and their home countries, acclimatize newcomers, integrate immigrant kids with their culture and raise awareness.

PROCEDURE

- Employed content analysis research method proposed by Deacon et al. (2021) to decode and frame the article sampled from the National Post, the Vancouver Sun and the Toronto Star. Similarly, 30 articles were sampled from the New Canadian Media and the World Journal for ethnic sources.
- ProQuest database used for mainstream media. For ethnic media, Google Advanced Search and internal search for World Journal were used.
- For World Journal, as it is a Chinese language website, we translated "immigrant" to "移民 (immigration) and "移民者 (immigrants).
- For each article, at least 3-5 quotes were sampled.
- All the data was transferred to an Excel sheet to generate statistical tables.

DATA

SOURCE

Source	Sample Size	Sample Period	Sample Frequency
National Post	30	2019-2021	Weekly
The Vancouver Sun	30	2019-2021	Weekly
Toronto Star	30	2019-2021	Weekly
New Canadian Media	30	2019-2021	Weekly
World Journal	30	2019-2021	Weekly

FRAMES

Source	Problem for Immigrants	Problem for Authorities	Problem for Society	Problem for Immigrants & Authorities	Problem for Immigrants & Society	Problem for Authorities & Society	Problem for Immigrants, Authorities & Society
National Post	33%	17%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%
The Vancouver Sun	33%	17%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%
Toronto Star	33%	17%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%
New Canadian Media	33%	17%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%
World Journal	33%	17%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%

NEWS TOPIC

Source	Policy	Elected and Party Officials	Problem for Immigrants	Problem for Authorities	Problem for Society	Problem for Immigrants & Authorities	Problem for Immigrants & Society	Problem for Authorities & Society	Problem for Immigrants, Authorities & Society
National Post	33%	17%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%
The Vancouver Sun	33%	17%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%
Toronto Star	33%	17%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%
New Canadian Media	33%	17%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%
World Journal	33%	17%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%	10%

CONCLUSION

Discussion

- For overall news topics, both media focus on policy-related issues.
- Both ethnic and mainstream media tend to quote from left-wing parties and pro-immigration associations.
- Ethnic media tends to promote problem-framing, including problems for immigrants and authorities. For immigrants, they highlight the potential violence, racism etc. Problems for authorities include the arrival of undocumented immigrants, stress on diplomatic relations etc.

RESULTS

Overall news topic:

Ethnic: Policy (60%), and Settlement services/Organisations (30%)
Mainstream: Policy (30%), Economy (30%) and Cultural Practices (40%)

News frame:

Ethnic: Problem for Immigrants (34%), Problem for Authorities (40%)
Mainstream: Solution Reform (39%), Problem for Authorities (37%)

News source:

Ethnic: Elected and Party Officials: Mainstream left (44%) and Pro-immigrant Associations and Far-Left Parties (20%)
Mainstream: Pro-immigrant Associations and Far-Left Parties (31%)

Acknowledgments:

We would like to express our gratitude to Professor Dr. Sherry Yu for her teachings in JOUR100 (Covering Immigration and Transnational Issues) and the Justice Institute. Ms. Paulina Kozminski for her assistance in data collection, and the research team for their suggestions were the guiding stars for this project's completion.

References:

- Deacon, D., Polking, M., Giddings, J., & Woodcock, G. (2021). Chapter 8. Content analysis in Research in Communication. In *Research in Communication: A practical guide to methods in media and cultural studies* (pp. 117-131). London: Taylor & Francis.
- Levine, L. M. (1991). Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, 41(5), 157-169.
- Sherry Yu, *Journal of Communication*, 11, 507-520.